

## What Type of Development for Sikkim?

**Sonam Sherpa** is a lecturer and in-charge in the Department of Economics, Salesian College, Sonada. He has worked mainly on the pattern of development in Sikkim. He was Research Assistant for the 'Development Induced Displacement in Sikkim 1975-2008' coordinated by NESRC (North Eastern Social Research Centre) Guwahati.

### Abstract

Displacement and deprivation have become intrinsic to India's development which most perceive as raising the standard of living through economic growth and improving the services required for a better lifestyle. However, Sonam's study shows that economic benefits do not reach every class and that some classes pay the price for the benefits that others get at their cost. One of its reasons is that development projects require a huge amount of land, and land is mostly acquired in the "backward regions" that are resource rich. Many of them are predominantly tribal areas or inhabited by rural poor classes. The project forces them to sacrifice their land in the name of "national development" whose benefits do not reach them. Moreover, since rehabilitation has been weak in most of the States it further leads to a high degree of impoverishment and marginalization.

---

**Keywords:** Marginalization, Impoverishment, Common Property Resources, Deprived Persons (DP), Project Affected Persons (PAPs), Development-Induced-Displacement (DID), Sustenance

---

### Introduction

Sikkim, the tiny hill state covering 7096 sq.km, is located between 27° 04 and 46 and 28° 07 and 48 North latitude and 88° 00 and 58 and 88° 55 and 25° East latitude and covers 0.22 percent of India's geographical area. The state is one of the four micro regions of the north-eastern Himalayas (the others being Darjeeling and Dooars of West Bengal and Arunachal Pradesh). The State is divided into four districts - East Sikkim, West Sikkim, South Sikkim and North Sikkim.

The early history of Sikkim is generally found in mythology and folklore. From what we can piece together, it is generally accepted that the Lepchas were its original inhabitants. They called Sikkim '*Nye-mae-el*' or heaven. The bhutias who came later named it '*Renjong*' or '*Denjong*' or The valley of rice. According to Limbu accounts the name Sikkim is a corrupt form of the Limbu word '*Sukhim*' meaning 'new house'. A British scholar, L.A Wadell claims that Sikkim is derived from the Sanskrit word '*Sikhim*' meaning 'Crested or mountainous land.'

The modern history of Sikkim begins with the consecration of Phuntsok Namgyal as the first '*Chogyal*' or Dharma Raja at Yoksum in 1642 A.D. He was a descendant of khye Bhumsa, meaning the superior of ten thousand heroes, a settler of Chumbi valley.

He came into close contact with the Lepchas and signed a blood brotherhood treaty with *Thekong Tak*, their chieftain, at Kabi lungchok. The first centralized administration of the country was organized by Phuntsok Namgyal who divided the country into 12 'dzongs' or districts and appointed a 'Dzongpen' in-charge for each. There were 12 chogyals in the Namgyal Dynasty.

The Sikkim-British treaty of 1861 signed in 'Tumlong', besides conferring on chogyal the title of Maharaja recognized Sikkim as a de facto British protectorate. In 1888, Sikkim was finally placed under the British superintendence and became a protectorate under the Anglo-Chinese convention of 1893. A political officer was stationed in the capital Gangtok, in order to advise and assist the maharaja in the governance of his state and to preside over his state council. This arrangement lasted till 1918 when Sir Tashi Namgyal was invested with full powers of administration of his kingdom. Ultimately in April, 1975, Sikkim was merged with India and became the 22nd State of the Indian Union. Today it is one of the smallest states in terms of area and population.

### **Demographic Profile of Sikkim**

In 2001, the population of Sikkim stood at 540851 (288484 male, 252367 female). It is 0.05 percent of India's total population. The north district accounts for 41030 of the total population, west district for 123256, south district for 131525 and east district for 45040 persons. Ethnically Sikkim has three main groups Nepalis, Bhutias and Lepchas. "According to Gazetteer of Sikkim (1891), Nepalis with 56 percent (including Murmi) constituted a majority of the population followed by the Lepchas (19 percent) and Bhutias (16 percent). There were other constituents like khambus and slaves."<sup>1</sup> More than a hundred and ten years later, the share of Lepcha population has gone down to 14 percent whereas that of Nepalis climbed to almost 70 percent with Bhutias constituting more or less the same proportion. All these three ethnic groups have their own languages, cultures and social practices and have a strong socio-cultural bond among them.

Out of this total population, 88.93 per cent that is almost 89 per cent of the population of the state lives in the rural areas. While speaking about the districts, we find that 96.96 per cent of the population in the north district lives in the rural areas while only 3.04 per cent are in urban area (Mangan Town). In the west district 98.52 per cent population lives in rural area, leaving 1.48 per cent in the urban areas. In the South district we find 97.00 per cent living in rural areas while the remaining 3.00 per cent are in the urban areas. Similarly, in the case of the east district we find 78.43 per cent inhabiting the rural area, and the other 21.57 per cent in the urban areas. The reason for the concentration of higher percentage of urban population in the east district is because all the four urban centres including the Census Town fall in the jurisdiction of the east district. There has been a growth of 30.19 per cent and 61.78 per cent in the

1 H.H. Risley, The Gazetteer of Sikkim 1894 in the Bengal Government Secretariat, Calcutta, quoted in *Sikkim Human Development Report (HDR) 2001*.

rural and urban population respectively during the decade 1991-2001. The sex ratio of Sikkim is 875 which is less than the national average. Its density is 76 and its decadal growth rate in 1991-2001 was 33.1 %, as against the national average of 21.34 %. The west district has the highest sex ratio of 929 and the north district has the lowest with 752. Its sex ratio for 0-6 years of age is 963, unlike the prosperous states of Punjab, Haryana and parts of Maharashtra, Gujarat and Tamilnadu where the ratio is below 800. The highest sex ratio for 0-6 years is 995 in the north district and the lowest is 950 in the east district, which is higher than the national average of 923. The sex ratio has declined since 1991.

**Table 1.1: Population, Sex Ratio, Urbanization and Literacy in Sikkim 2001.**

District Category	Population				Urbanization		Literacy %		
	Total	Sex R	Density	Growth	Urban	Rural	Male	Female	Total
East	245040	844	257	37.3	52852	192188	81.2	66.8	74.7
West	123256	929	106	25.6	1824	121432	66.8	50.1	58.8
South	131525	927	175	33.4	3946	127579	74.3	59.7	67.3
North	41030	752	10	31.3	39782	1248	75.7	55.4	67.2
Sikkim	540851	875	76	33.1	59780	480981	76	60.4	68.8

Source: District Census Hand Book 2001: Census CD-2001.

The literacy rate of Sikkim is 68.8%, which is much higher than the national average of 55.39%. Table 2.1 however shows the regional differences within the state. The highest literacy rate is in the east district with 74.7% and the lowest is in the west district with 58.8%. The male literacy rate is 76 % as against 64.21% in India as a whole, but in the east district it is 81.20% as against 66.8% in west district. The female literacy rate is 60.4% as against the national average of 45.94%, but it is 66.8% in the east district and 50.10% in the west district (DCHB 2001). Therefore, the west district shows the lowest literacy rate and the highest sex ratio whereas the east district shows the highest rate of urbanization, highest literacy rate but the lowest sex ratio.

### Developmental phase in Sikkim

Basically the developmental phase in Sikkim had begun after the post merger with Indian union. Before the merger with the Indian union in 1975, Sikkim had only one major hospital, The Sir Tashi Namgyal Memorial (STNM) Hospital, which was established in 1917 with 50 beds and three doctors.

The difficult terrain, which increases the unit cost of service delivery as well as the resource constraints, had their impact in terms of unmet health targets in the state. However, the progress made after the merger is appreciated. In 1980 only 0.04 percent of the state budget was allocated to health. But in 1990 the allocation increased to 0.43 percent and further to 5 percent in 1998. In 1979, Sikkim had only four hospitals (located at Singtam, Gyalshing, Namchi and Mangan) in addition to the Central

Referral Hospital at Gangtok. Moreover, the STNM Hospital at Gangtok has now expanded with a comprehensive array of specialized services and around 300 beds.

**Table 1.2: Health Centres in Sikkim as on 2008**

Sl. No.	Category	Total
1	Primary Health Sub-Centre	147
2	Primary Health Care	24
3	Community Health Care	4
4	District Hospital	4

Source: Sikkim Report, [url.www.sikkim.gov.in](http://www.sikkim.gov.in)

Today there are 24 primary Health centers (PHCs), 147 Primary Health Sub-centres (PHSCs) and 4 community Health centres in the state. This makes Sikkim possibly the only State in the country to achieve the national norm of establishing 1 primary health centre for 20,000 people and 1 PHSC for 30,000 people (on the basis of a projected population growth in 1998). The utilization pattern of health services indicates that the overwhelming majority of the people depend on the PHCs and PHSCs.<sup>2</sup>

### Education in the Post-merger Period

The post merger period of Sikkim with the Indian Union shows that there has been a steady increase in the number of schools and in the number of teachers. In 1998-99 out of the total number of 1,474 schools in the state, 50 per cent were pre-primary schools, followed by primary schools (34 per cent), middle school (9 per cent), secondary schools (5 per cent) and higher secondary schools (2 per cent).

However, the distribution of schools is uneven in the state. The north district has the lowest concentration of schools due to its low population density. In 1998-99, hardly 10 per cent of pre-primary schools were located in the north district as against 31 per cent in the east district and 29 per cent in the south district. Its percentage share was nearly 11 per cent of primary schools, while it was as low as 7 per cent for middle and higher secondary schools. It is interesting to observe that 50 per cent of the schools employed hardly 10 per cent of the total number of teachers. This can be attributed to the fact that there are a number of schools where the school teacher ratio is hardly 1: 1.02. The primary schools with 35 per cent share in the total number of schools account for a major share of the total number of teachers of 7,771 in the State. The middle schools account for 22 per cent of the total number of teachers followed by secondary schools with 19 per cent and higher secondary schools with 14 per cent.

The education sector has been receiving high priority in the state. This can be reflected in the quantum increase in the expenditure on this sector during the last

2 Chutani & Gytso, Gytso & Bagds, *Health Status in Sikkim*, Department of Health & Family Welfare, Government of Sikkim, Gangtok, Sikkim HDR, 1993 & 1998, pp. 33-40.

three plan periods. In the Sixth Plan period (1980-85), the expenditure in the education sector was ₹ 145.877 million as against the budget allocation of Rs 8.3 million. This differential increased in the Seventh Plan period (1985-90) when against the budget allocation of 264 million the expenditure was of ₹ 394.62 million, and further in the Eighth Plan period (1992-97) with an allocation of 606 million and an expenditure of ₹ 872.198 million.

The increase in the expenditure on education sector is reflected by the steady growth in the literacy rates among the population aged 7 years and above. Their literacy rates increased from 17 per cent in 1971 to nearly 57 per cent in 1991. During the same period the rise in female literacy rate has been very impressive, moving from 8.9 per cent to over 46 per cent. It may also be noted that between 1981 and 1991, Sikkim recorded the second highest improvement (of 15.31 percentage points) in literacy rates among the north-eastern States.

**Table 1.3: Government and Private Educational Institutions as on 31st March 2008**

SI No.	Category	No	Nature
1	Lower Primary School	154	State Govt.
2	Primary School	284	State Govt.
3	Primary School (SSA)	43	State Govt.
4	Upper Primary School (JHS)	150	State Govt.
5	Secondary School	92	State Govt.
6	Senior Secondary School	42	State Govt.
	<b>Total</b>	765	

#### OTHER INSTITUTIONS & COLLEGE

SI No.	Category	No	Nature
1	State Government College	4	State Govt.
2	Research Institute of Tibetology	1	State Govt.
3	Sikkim Manipal Institute of Technology, Majitar East Sikkim	1	Private
4	Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science, Tadong	1	Private
5	Harkamaya College of Education (B.Ed)	1	Private
6	Himalayan Pharmacy Institute, Rangpoo	1	Private
7	Loyala College of Education, Namchi	1	Private
8	Sanskrit Mahavidyalaya	1	State Govt.
9	SHEDA, Deorali	1	State Govt.
	<b>TRAINING INSTITUTE FOR TEACHER</b>		
10	District Institute of Education & Training (DIET)	1	State Govt.
11	State Institute of Education / SCERT	1	State Govt.
12	Carmel Teacher Training Institution	1	Private
	<b>TECHNICAL TRAINING INSTITUTE</b>		

13	ITI, Rangpoo	1	Private
14	ATTC, Bardang (Polytechnic)	1	Private
15	CCCT, Chisopani (Polytechnic)	1	Private
<b>OTHER INSTITUTES</b>			
16	Sanskrit Pathshalas	12	State Govt.
17	Islamic Schools	7	State Govt.
<b>UNIVERSITIES</b>			
18	Sikkim University, Samdur	1	Central Govt.
19	The Sikkim Manipal University, Tadong	1	Private
20	Institute of Chartered Financial Analysts of India (ICFAI) University, Sikkim.	1	Private
21	Eastern Institute for Integrated Learning in Management (EILM) University, Sikkim	1	Private

Source: Annual Financial Report HRD 2007, Sikkim, [url.www.sikkim.gov.in](http://www.sikkim.gov.in)

In view of the distribution of Sikkim's population among various age groups there is a need for increasing the number of colleges and technical institutes in the state. The present figure of four full time colleges is in fact not quite sufficient. In addition to this opening of a Central University has paved the way for qualitative education including research and development in the state.

### Industrial Development

The industrial sector has never been a priority in Sikkim .It is clearly reflected in the outlay made on the industries throughout the planning period. Distillation of wines and liquors was one of the first modern industries established at Singtam in 1955. Immediately after the merger all the four districts were declared as being industrially backward, but even today the state has very few industries, particularly in the public sector.

**Table 1.4: Industries in Sikkim March 2004**

SI No.	Particulars	Total
1	Provisionally registered small Scale units	367
2	Permanently Registered units	363
3	Cottage Industries	36
4	Medium Scale units	3
5	PSUs	3
6	Joint Sector Undertaking	N.A.
7	Non-Functioning Units	87

Source: Department of Industries Govt. of Sikkim, [url.www.sikkim.gov.in](http://www.sikkim.gov.in)

In fact, Sikkim does not have a single major PSU. There are 363 permanently registered units, most of which are minor. There are also 367 provisionally registered

units. More than 70 percent of them are located in the east district, thereby showing a disproportionately high concentration of Industrial units in certain geographical location. The state government has taken several initiatives to boost the level of industrialization activities in Sikkim. The Sikkim Industrial Development and Investment Corporation Limited (SIDICO) was set up in 1977 as a state-level principal financial institution, for promoting and financing the industrial sector. The inclusion of Sikkim in north east council is likely to trigger off a major breakthrough in the industrial sector. To attract investment, more liberal incentives were enunciated in 1991 and a policy for the northeast was formulated in 2001.<sup>3</sup>

### Infrastructural development

State infrastructure has been the most crucial aspect of development in Sikkim. This is further made critical by the fact that Sikkim has most of its areas located in hill and mountain regions. In every aspect of Sikkim's development process connectivity has been a major bottleneck. Limited market accessibility, underdeveloped communication systems, restrictions on the free movement of people, goods and services and most importantly the recurrent natural calamities have adversely affected the development process.

Over the years there has been a significant progress in all fronts of infrastructural developments in Sikkim. More importantly, the state is now increasingly getting exposed to modern means of communications and hence the process of social mobilization has been steady. The expansion of the fixed telephone network across the state, the successful proliferation of mobile phones in the state and the spread of internet connectivity to even the remote parts of the state have been increased substantially.

**Table 1.5: Road Statistics of Sikkim**

Category	Black Top Length	Unsurfaced Length	Total Length
<b>A. State PWD</b>			
State Highways	184	-	184
Major District Roads	520	202	722
Other District Roads	439	545	984
New ODR	-	89	89
Sub Total A	1143	836	1979
<b>B. BRO</b>			
National Highways	40	-	40
North Sikkim Highway	67	-	67
Other Border Roads	787	-	787
Sub Total B	894	-	894
<b>Grand Total (A+B)</b>	<b>2037</b>	<b>836</b>	<b>2873</b>

Source: Government of Sikkim Economic Survey 2006-07

<sup>3</sup> Walter Fernandes, Gita Bharali & Kezo Venendo, *The UN Indigenous Decade in Northeast India*, Guwahati, NESRC, 2008, pp. 70-73.

Sikkim nationalized transport has been in continuous service since 1946 and it is playing the vital role for the development of the state .It has integrated various difficult areas and has provided goods and service to the people in remote areas and has also worked as supportive agency to the transport network in the state. In 2003-04, it had a fleet of 106 buses and 106 tankers/trucks, with services on 43 passengers and goods routes. It has a monopoly in transport services in the state. The SNT carries about 60 percent of the total freight while the remaining 40 percent is carried by private operators. Having situated in difficult terrain the state is able to run a four seated helicopter service from Gangtok to Bagdogra. Further a rail link between Rangpoo and Siliguri has already been given a green signal and besides this, feasibility report on linking New Jalpaiguri in West Bengal and Jorethang in the Sikkim is under consideration by the central and the state government. The central government has also sanctioned an airport for Sikkim This airport project is likely to bring substantive changes in the tourism arrival both from within and outside the country which will play a multiple role for the development in the state.

### **Power Development: Structure, potential and challenges**

The power situation of Sikkim before its merger in 1975 was in its infancy because the demand itself was low. The power requirement of Gangtok and a few townships falling along the National Highway was met from the small 2.1 MW Jali Power which was commissioned in 1964. Also, a small Diesel Powerhouse was used as a standby to meet the emergencies. Similarly, Rothak (South) and Rimbi (West) micro-hydels with an installed capacity of 200 kW each were under operation to feed the District Headquarters and major townships in the South and West districts, while the North district had to manage with a 50 KW micro-hydel unit known as manual micro-hydel, which has since become inoperative. Till the end of 1975, there were only 8 declared towns that used electricity in Sikkim, while rest of the areas had no power supply.

**Table 1.6: Installed Capacity in Sikkim in MW**

Sl. No	Name of the Power House	Installed capacity in MW
1	Lower Lagyap (H)	12
2	Jali power house(H)	2.1
3	Rimbi-I (H)	0.6
4	Rongnichu-II	2.5
5	Chaten (lachen) (H)	0.1
6	Rimbi-II (H)	1.0
7	Lachung (H)	0.2
8	Mayongchu (H)	4.0
9	Upper Rongnichu (H)	8.0
10	Diesel Power House (D)	5.0
11	Rothak (H)	0.2
12	Kalez Khola (H)	2.0



13	Rabomchu (H)	3.0
	Total Under State Sector	40.70
14	Rangit-III under NHPC	60
	Total Installed Capacity	100.70

Source: Annual Report, Energy and Power Department, 2008-09

In Sikkim, its hydel-power potential of 8,000 MW remains highly unharnessed. As a result, Sikkim hardly contributes 0.2 percent of the country's total installed capacity. The State Government thought that Teesta has a huge untapped-hydro potential and that it should be harnessed in order to optimize the use of its water resources. In order to commercialize the hydel potential of the state, the government has constituted Sikkim Power Development Corporation Ltd. (SPDC) to implement both hydel-power projects and to lay the associated transmission lines. The state also mobilizes capital for this purpose through the public, private or the joint sector. Therefore, apart from the development of various small, mini and micro hydel projects the state has also allotted 25 HEP to NHPC and to private developers and their total capacity is 5188 MW.

**Table 1.7: list of the Projects awarded to Various Parties in Sikkim**

Sl. No.	Scheme	Agency	Capacity MW	Commission in	Na
1	Teesta-I	Himalayan Green Energy	280	2011-12	JV
2	Teesta-II	Him Urja Infr. Pvt. Ltd.	330	2011-12	JV
3	Teesta-III	Teesta Urja Ltd. N Delhi	1200	2011-12	JV
4	Teesta-IV	NHPC	495	2011-12	JV
5	Teesta-VI	Lanco Energy Pvt. Ltd.	500	2011-12	JV
6	Lachen	NHPC N Delhi	210	2011-12	CPSU
7	Panam	Himgiri Hydro Ltd. Hyd	300	2010-11	JV
8	Rangyong	BSCPL-SCLJVture Hyd	117	2011-12	PRIVATE
9	Rongichu	Madhya Bharat Power Corporation	96	2010-11	PRIVATE
10	Sada Mangder	Gati Infrastructures Ltd. Hyd	71	2010-11	PRIVATE
11	Chujachen	Gati Infrastructures Ltd. Hyd	96	2009-10	PRIVATE
12	Bhasmey	Gati Infrastructures Ltd. Hyd	32	2010-11	PRIVATE
13	Rolep	Amalgamated Transpower Ltd. N Delhi	36	2009-10	PRIVATE
14	Chukangchu	Amalgamated Transpower Ltd. N Delhi	50	2010-11	PRIVATE
15	Ralong	Amalgamated Transpower Ltd. N Delhi	40	2010-11	PRIVATE
16	Rangit-II	Sikkim Hydro Ventures Hyderabad	60	2010-11	PRIVATE
17	Rangit-IV	Jal Power Corporation Hyderabad	120	2010-11	JV
18	Dickchu	Sneha Kinetic Power projects ltd. Hyderabad	54	2010-11	PRIVATE

19	Jorethang-HEP	DANS Energy Pvt. Ltd. Delhi	96	2010-11	PRIVATE
20	Lingza		120	2011-12	MOU NOT SIGNED
21	Thangchi	Lachung Power Pvt. Ltd.	40	2010-11	PRIVATE
22	Bimkyong	Teesta Power Pvt. Ltd. N Delhi	99	2011-12	PRIVATE
23	Bop	Chungthang Power Pvt. Ltd.	90	2011-12	PRIVATE
24	Ting Ting	SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	70	2010-11	PRIVATE
25	Rateychu-Bhakchachu	Coastal Projects Pvt. Ltd.	40	2010-11	PRIVATE
26	Teesta-V	NHPC	510	2006-07	CPSU
		<b>Total</b>	<b>5188</b>		

Source: Energy and Power Department, Annual Report, 2008-09

However the installed capacity and firm capacity of the operational units in the last 32 years since 1975 works out to about 1.4 MW installed capacity (0.8 MW firm) per year. The state needs to add at least 4-5 MW every year to cater the growing demand of the electricity in the state.

## Tourism

Building on its unique resources the State Government wants to concentrate on tourism, power generation, educational and traditional agro-based industries.<sup>4</sup> The comparative advantage of Sikkim lies in its tourism sector. If developed properly it can be a major source of income and employment. Tourism creates jobs not only in the tertiary sector but also encourages growth in the primary and secondary sectors. However, it was in the mid 1990s when the tourism sector really started accelerating in the state both because of a conscious tourism development plan of the state and Government and the political disturbance in the hill areas of Darjeeling and Jammu and Kashmir. The Tata Economic Consultancy Services prepared a Tourism Master Plan in 1998 and projection of 3, 71,743 tourists by 2011. The entire tourism sector policy of the government is now driven by the mantra of making Sikkim the "Number 1 Eco-Tourism Destination in India". With this view in mind, the State Government has made special effort to develop tourist villages, trekking routes, adventure activities, Bio-diversity parks, hotels and cultural centres.

**Table: 1.8: Details of Tourist Arrival in Sikkim from 1981-2005**

Year	Domestic	Foreign	Total
1981	19115	2739	21854
1991	61360	6187	67547
1994	92435	6888	99323

4 Kalyan Chaudhari, "Thrust on Development", in *Frontline*, April 13, 2001, pp. 89-90.

1997	116500	8068	124568
2001	146923	7757	154680
2004	233285	12912	246197
2005	251744	16523	268267

Source: Government of Sikkim Economic Survey, 2006-07

The above data on tourist arrival exhibits the role of effective policy of the state government in tourism front. The table shows that there is a rapid increase in the flow of number of tourist in an average of 10,000 (approximately) between 1991 to 1994. The trend remains continued over the years in an increasing basis. However, foreigners still require Restricted Area Permit (RAP) to travel Sikkim.

### Development and Displacement Issues

Since the merger of Sikkim with the Indian union the all-round developmental works have begun in all fronts. Initially the focus was on defence and slowly the other projects were also launched. Because of a hilly terrain the focus has been shifted to water resources. There have been schemes of industries, housing, tourism and human resource development which ultimately brought displacement because displacement is another side of the same coin in the present understanding of development.

Most of the decision-makers see development as an economic growth and an infrastructure building. They assume that the physical improvements help the country as a whole to compete with the developed nations but in the process they fail to ask the questions like whose development at whose cost? Do the benefits of the infrastructure and of economic growth reach most citizens? Do those who pay a heavy price for such development get its benefits? One has to deal with this issue because studies as well as field experience point to the impoverishment and marginalization of persons whom projects built in the name of national development displace (DP) or deprive of sustenance without physical relocation (PAP). Further the Supreme Court has interpreted Article 21 of the Indian Constitution as every citizen's right to life with dignity. It would mean that those who have to pay the price for the development should also get benefits of the projects. But studies indicate that this does not happen in reality. They pay the price for the development of another class. That turns displacement into an issue of human rights.

The planned developmental projects displace people and deprive them of their sustenance without their consent and more often it results in their impoverishment and marginalization so, today, it has become the issue of human rights. One cannot deny the facts that post merger planned development in Sikkim too created displacement.

The development project treats the private land and common property resources (CPRs) that are their sustenance only as a commodity. Also CPR dependants lose their sustenance

due to the project but the state counts only the individual land losers as DP/PAPs because the colonial laws that continues to be in force in India recognizes only individual pattas.<sup>5</sup>

Their dependants are not included among the displaced ones though most of them have lived on them for centuries before the individual ownership based colonial laws were enacted. Further, most CPR dependants belong to the tribal or poorest among the backward communities like quarry and fish workers. Many others do not own land in the legal sense but sustain themselves on it by rendering services to the community as agricultural labourers.<sup>6</sup>

It has been pointed out that 'many projects also cause indirect DPs when environmental and other consequences such as fly ash generated by the thermal, aluminum and other plants pollute the land around them and render it unusable, and its dependants are unable to sustain themselves on it'.<sup>7</sup> Also other facts such as noise, dust pollution and constant blasts in the coalmines force people to leave their homes'.<sup>8</sup> But the law does not consider them DPs because legally they leave their homes on their own accord but in reality the environmental and other impacts of the projects force them to leave. Those, whom the project deprives of their sustenance are divided into DPs and PAPs. DPs are those who are forced to leave their homes and relocate themselves. For example, the 9000 families uprooted by the Dumber dam in Tripura, the 600 families by IIT, Guwahati,<sup>9</sup> the 56 families displaced in Sikkim by Sikkim Teesta stage V Daring Phase I and 282 families by water resource, 110 families by the Panchagram Paper mill in Hailakandi district, Assam are DPs. Others lose some or most of their land and sustenance or their access to natural resources but are not relocated. For example, 110 families were displaced by Panchgram paper mill and 100 more families lost their land but were not relocated.

The action of acquiring land and depriving people of their sustenance without their consent has led to struggles against displacement. Some may agree to give their land for the project but struggle against their possible impoverishment because of poor resettlement and rehabilitation or lack of it. Most struggles are lost and people are displaced but the struggle forces the project to resettle them. However, most steps taken by the project lead only to resettlement, not to rehabilitation.

5 Usha Ramanathan, "The land Acquisition Act 1894: Displacement and State Power", in Hari Mohan (ed.), *India: Social Development Report 2008: Development Induced Displacement (DID)*, Council for Social Development, Oxford University Press, 2008, pp. 23-38.

6 Vasuda Dhangwar, *Refugee Rehabilitation: Policy and institutional Change required, 1989, DID in Sikkim 1975-2008 Report by NESRC, Guwahati.*

7 E. Ganguly Thukral (ed.), *Development, Displacement and Rehabilitation: Issues for a National Debate*, Indian Social Institute, DID in Sikkim, Vol 11, New Delhi, 1999, pp. 177-184.

8 Fernandes, Walter & S. Anthony Raj, *Development Displacement and Rehabilitation in Tribal areas of Orissa*, Indian Social Institute, New Delhi, 1992.

9 Monirul Hussain, "State Development and Population Displacement in North East India" Cited in, DID and deprivation in Sikkim, 1975-2008, report by NESRC, Guwahati.

Most decision-makers think that resettlement and rehabilitation are same but they are different process. Resettlement is one-time relocation with or without other social or economic support. Rehabilitation, on the other hand, involves rebuilding the economic resources, cultural systems, social structures and community support mechanisms that people lose at the alienation of their livelihood. This long process begins much before the displacement or deprivation or physical resettlement and lasts several years after it. It is based on the principle of replacement value and is intrinsic to the demand that the lifestyle of the DP/PAPs be better after the project because before it they pay the price for the project. Only the DPs need resettlement because they lose their homestead and have to be relocated. But both DPs and PAPs lose their livelihood and therefore need rehabilitation but in practice very few are even resettled.

The reason why the resettlement very rarely results in rehabilitation is that, most DP/PAPs are poor and live in an informal society. It is true particularly of CPR dependants. Most of them live in an informal society and are not used to the formal economy therefore are in less contact with the formal sector than other citizens. But their deprivation pushes them into that society with no preparation for the interface. The projects authorities by and large understand only the economic component of rehabilitation and not its social and cultural factors. So they attend to physical relocation at times with some economic support. Even if resettled, people are unable to deal with society.

Therefore, the big question that arises is what type of development for the nation in general and Sikkim in particular. After the merger of Sikkim with Indian union the development in various sectors has geared up for which state has to acquire land from the people and also to use CPR.

**Table 1.9: A Conservative Estimate of Land used in Sikkim for Development Projects 1975-2008 (acres).**

Project Category	Private	%	Forest	%	Total	%
Water Resources	11698.10	69.43	5150.57	30.57	16848.67	12.80
Industry	83.3	96.34	3.61	3.66	86.91	00.07
Mines	40.59	87.18	5.97	12.82	46.56	00.04
Tourism	35.85	50.13	35.67	49.87	71.52	00.06
Non-Hydel Power	15126.04	97.70	357.61	2.30	15483.65	12.68
Environmental Protection	9.21	100.00	00.00	00.00	9.21	00.01
Farms and Fisheries	356.16	100.00	00.00	00.00	356.16	00.29
Defence and Security	9212.98	63.70	188.07	36.30	9401.05	7.70
Transport and Communication	67476.16	99.78	150.36	00.22	67626.52	55.39
Health	275.54	98.98	2.85	01.02	278.39	00.23
HRD	10668.88	99.97	3.16	00.03	10672.04	8.74
Urban Development	173.21	100.00	00.00	00.00	173.91	00.14

Tourism	179.21	92.27	15.02	7.73	194.23	00.16
Administration	373.82	99.75	0.93	00.25	374.75	00.31
Farms and Fisheries	413.23	100.00	00.00	00.00	413.23	00.34
Social Welfare	12.35	100.00	00.00	00.00	12.35	00.01
Housing Welfare and Others	32.76	100.00	00.00	00.00	32.76	00.03
Total	116168.09	95.16	5936.14	4.84	122081.96	100.00

Source: Development Induced Displacement and Deprivation in Sikkim 1975-2008, Report by NESRC, Guwahati.

The above table shows the study done by the NESRC, Guwahati which estimated that 12208.96 acres of land has been used for the different projects in Sikkim till 2008. Therefore, one can understand the process of displacement also exists in Sikkim. All the studies show that water resources are the biggest displacing agent, as between half to two thirds of the land they use is CPRs and that they have a high percentage of tribal DP/PAPs. However, data on common land could not get from Sikkim and that can affect the DP/PAPs type.

**Table 1.10: Deprivation by various projects in Sikkim 1975-2008**

Sl. No.	Category	SC	ST	MOBC	GEN	NA	Total
1	Water Resources	2	123	128	28	1	282
2	Industry	1	4	6	0	0	11
3	Mines	0	4	2	0	0	6
4	Non-Hydel Power	2	82	105	0	0	189
5	Environment	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
6	Farms and Fisheries	2	32	25	2	0	62
7	Defence	0	12	6	0	0	18
8	Transport and Communication	59	1074	1094	175	81	2483
9	HRD Development	8	74	112	13	299	496
10	Administration	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
11	Urban Development	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
12	Social Welfare	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
13	Tourism	0	50	39	3	0	92
14	Others	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
	Total	74	1455	1517	221	381	3639

Source: Development Induced Displacement and Deprivation in Sikkim 1975-2008, Report by NESRC, Guwahati.

The above table gives us the clear idea of development and displacement in Sikkim. A large number of water resource projects have been implemented but no account exists of the number of persons and their DPs. Information exists on 282 families

which could be 1,551 persons at the rate of 5.5 members in a family. As much as 43.62 percent of them are tribals which come to 20.6 percent of the state's total population. The proportion will be high if the information on the CPRs could be found. Non-hydel projects displaced 189 families, 496 families by HRD and 2483 families by transport and communication. That takes us to the total number of 3639 families which would be 18,195 persons at the rate of 5.5 members in the family. The studies show that around 6 percent of the population has been affected by the development projects. But in Sikkim, according to 2001 census, the figure comes to 3.36 percent of its total population. But one can take for granted that the percentage will be higher if the information on the CPRs could be collected. Sikkim also highlights the scenario of the other states in the type of people affected by the development projects. At all India level 40 percent of the estimated DP/PAPs are tribal and 20 percent belongs to SC category. Sikkim has a very small number of SC populations but 20.6 percent of its population is tribal.

Since the picture of displacement in Sikkim is same with that of other states the rehabilitation and the compensation processes also reflect the very trend of the remaining states. The studies done by the NESRC show that there is no question of resettlement leaving rehabilitation alone. It should be clear that if people are displaced, there cannot be rehabilitation without resettlement and this very aspect cannot be verified because of lack of information on the number of DP/PAPs. In the absence of resettlement, compensation can become a step towards rehabilitation. But it depends on the quantum and the speed with which it is paid. However, compensation is one aspect and cannot be considered as rehabilitation itself. The monetary compensation is inadequate without other support systems. For example, the land losers used to get much of their food and other basic needs from the land and forests that they lose. After displacement they have to depend on the market for these needs. If DPs are not resettled, they have to spend more than what they get as compensation on building a new house.

Moreover, compensation is given in the market price and it is low in the administratively neglected or backward areas. Further, most of the land losers belong to the backward classes who are not exposed to the formal economy therefore the sudden changeover in their lifestyle push them into the society without adequate preparation and the consequence is further marginalization. This is an issue in Sikkim too because the Teesta river has been identified as a major source of hydro power and also many hydro power projects are being planned in order to turn the region into a power house for India and southeast Asia which will bring more displacement in Sikkim. Studies show that when the communities are deprived of their sustenance and are impoverished, they too run the risk of being impoverished and marginalized. It is in this perspective that one has to look at the future plans in Sikkim and the rest of the Northeast.<sup>10</sup> The new economic policy of the government adds to the worsening

10 Gita Bharali, Social and Environmental cost of Development-Induced Displacement: An appraisal of cost benefits analysis in Assam, Department of Economics, Dibrugarh University, Ph. D Thesis, 2009.

situation because profits are its basic motives. One of its assumptions is that much more land than in the past will be acquired in order to encourage Indian and foreign private investment. In other words, more displacement is to be expected in the near future.

## **Conclusion**

One cannot deny the fact that country requires regular growth and development of the economy in the entire sector to achieve its goal in the future but one has to ask the question on whose cost and what type of development? Whenever development begins displacement is the consequence and therefore one has to come up with an alternative by which development can be carried out without displacement or, in other words, with good rehabilitation for the displaced ones. This can be done only if rehabilitation is recognized as a right. The duty of the project to help the DP/PAPs to begin a new life is to be recognized and the norm that no one can be displaced without rehabilitation needs to be an integral part of the project to be accepted. The planning commission approves a project on the basis of 1:1.5 cost-benefits but it is rarely evaluated later. So the time and cost overruns and underutilization of the capacity are not studied. For example, Study of the Public Account Committee on 20 major dams in 1980 shows that not a single project had been completed in less than a five years time being overrun and 500 percent cost overrun. Benefits are often exaggerated in order to get it sanctioned by the planning commission. But a large number of schemes run below capacity.

For example, 6 of the 12 major dams surveyed and studied by the Comptroller and Auditor General in 1975-76 shows that one was running at less than 30 percent of its capacity, four less than 40, one at 49.2, two at 50-60, two below 80 and two above it. The average came to 64.4 percent. The PAC points out the lack of thorough study before planning a project as one of its causes.<sup>11</sup>

But the outcome is that the benefit decreases to less than 1:1. Therefore, the policy makers and the project approval agencies need to keep regular attention on the ongoing project so that the ultimate benefit of the project can reach to the people who gave their land for the developmental purpose.

The social cost of the project has also to be quantified. Today the projects count only some marketable commodities in the formal sense but one should add the benefits of the informal economy that the people used to get from the resources. Further, it should add the intangibles such as social structures and the cultural and community support mechanisms. 'By alienating them from their communities, the project deprives them even of their identity.'<sup>12</sup>

11 Shekhar Singh, Asish Kothari & Kulan Amin, "Evaluating Major irrigation Project as in India" in Enakshi Ganguly Thukral (ed.), *Big Dams Displaced People: Rivers of Sorrow, Rivers of change*, New Delhi, Sage Publication, 1992, pp. 169-186.

12 Gita Bharali, Social and Environmental cost of Development-Induced Displacement: An appraisal of cost benefits analysis in Assam, Department of Economics, Dibrugarh University, PhD Thesis, 2009.



In order to prevent the impoverishment and marginalization one has to first recognize that a developmental process must be based on the rational choice of the people. Democratic rights in the form of the legal protection have to be provided to the victims of development and to be allowed to take a part in the decision making. No other benefit makes any sense if they are not taken as human beings and citizens with equal rights. To involve DP/PAPs in decision making one has to recognize that the assets acquired are their livelihood that has to be replaced based on Article 21 in Indian constitution so that the norm of the compensation is to be 'replacement' and not merely the 'market value'.<sup>13</sup>

All the dependants of the land acquired have to be compensated whether they are patta, non - patta or CPR dependants. Thus, compensation has to become a mode of replacing the assets, particularly who depends on non-patta land and forest. The authorities and funders have to go beyond the money-centered approach to provide a productivity and social justice. The importance of the good of the people affected by the project has to be viewed as important as the productivity of the project. With this in view, the rehabilitation needs to be turned into people's development at large. Unless and until the rehabilitation is considered as the right of the people one will continuously raise the question, 'what type of development for the nation in general and Sikkim in particular?'

13 The author has relied on the report of the research project conducted by NESRC and Salesian College on "Development Induced Displacement in Sikkim", in which he was a research assistant.